



Harrogate Borough Council

Local Retail Impact Thresholds Advisory Note

Peter Brett Associates

December 2014

61 Oxford Street, Manchester, M1 6EQ

T: +44 (0)161 245 8900 F: +44 (0)161 245 8901 E: manchester@peterbrett.com

Document Control Sheet

Project Name: **Local Retail Impact Thresholds**

Report Title: **Advisory Note**

Project Ref: **32510**

	Name	Position	Signature	Date
Prepared by:	Darren Tweed	Senior Planner	DT	19/11/14
Reviewed by:	Jonathan Wadcock	Associate	JW	19/12/14
Approved by:	Bernard Greep	LLP Director	BG	22/12/14
For and on behalf of Peter Brett Associates LLP				

Peter Brett Associates LLP disclaims any responsibility to the client and others in respect of any matters outside the scope of this report. This report has been prepared with reasonable skill, care and diligence within the terms of the contract with the client and taking account of the manpower, resources, investigations and testing devoted to it by agreement with the client. This report has been prepared for the client and Peter Brett Associates LLP accepts no responsibility of whatsoever nature to third parties to whom this report or any part thereof is made known. Any such party relies upon the report at their own risk.

© Peter Brett Associates LLP 2014

THIS REPORT IS FORMATTED FOR DOUBLE-SIDED PRINTING.



CONTENTS

- 1 INTRODUCTION..... 1**
- 2 RETAIL POLICY AND EVIDENCE BASE..... 3**
 - Harrogate Core Strategy 3
 - Sites and Policies Development Plan Document..... 3
 - Harrogate Retail Study (2014) 5
 - Town and local centre monitoring 5
- 3 LOCAL THRESHOLD CONSIDERATIONS..... 6**
 - Scale of proposals relative to town centres..... 6
 - Existing viability and vitality of town centres / vulnerability of local town centres..... 9
 - Cumulative effects of recent developments 11
 - Likely effects of further development on any town centre strategy / planned investment
 13
- 4 RECOMMENDATIONS..... 15**
 - Other main town centre uses 17

TABLES

- Table 1 – Retail floorspace in largest centres (total gross) 7
- Table 2 – Retail floorspace in largest centres (10% of total gross) 7
- Table 3 – Gross comparison retail unit size (number of units) 8
- Table 4 – Gross convenience retail unit size (number of units) 9
- Table 5 – Assessment of ‘large’ unit size by centre (gross) 9
- Table 6 – Potential ‘vulnerability’ to edge/out-of-centre development..... 11
- Table 7 – Location of planning applications for new retail floorspace (2004-2014) 12
- Table 8 – Planning application outcomes for new retail floorspace (2004-14)..... 13
- Table 9 – Convenience goods threshold – balanced assessment 16
- Table 10 – Comparison goods threshold – balanced assessment..... 16

FIGURES

- Figure 1 – Core Strategy Retail Policy JB4 adopted February 2009..... 3
- Figure 2 – Relevant parts of draft Policy JB7 (now withdrawn)..... 4

1 INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) was published in March 2012 and sets out the requirements of national policy, insofar as it relates to planning for the location of retail and other main town centres uses.
- 1.2 Paragraph 26 of the NPPF states that *‘when assessing applications for retail, leisure and office development outside of town centres, which are not in accordance with an up-to-date Local Plan, local planning authorities should require an impact assessment if the development is over a proportionate, locally set floorspace threshold (if there is no locally set threshold, the default threshold is 2,500sq m). This should include assessment of:*
- *the impact of the proposal on existing, committed and planned public and private investment in a centre or centres in the catchment area of the proposal; and*
 - *the impact of the proposal on town centre vitality and viability, including local consumer choice and trade in the town centre and wider area, up to five years from the time the application is made.’*
- 1.3 In this advisory note, we consider whether it is necessary to set a local retail floorspace threshold within Harrogate District, and if so, what a *‘proportionate’* and appropriate threshold should be. The NPPF itself provides no further guidance on this matter, and so we refer to the National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG) launched by the Government on 6th March 2014.
- 1.4 The NPPG is an online resource streamlining and consolidating over 7,000 pages of supporting guidance to national planning policies. Formal publication of this new resource replaced over 150 circulars, guidance notes and letters, including the Planning Policy Statement 4 Practice Guidance (PG) on Need, Impact and the Sequential Approach.
- 1.5 Paragraph 16 of *‘Ensuring the Vitality of Town Centres’* in the NPPG¹ states that *‘in setting a locally appropriate threshold it will be important to consider the:*
- *scale of proposals relative to town centres;*
 - *the existing viability and vitality of town centres;*
 - *cumulative effects of recent developments;*
 - *whether local town centres are vulnerable;*
 - *likely effects of development on any town centre strategy; and*
 - *impact on any other planned investment’.*
- 1.6 We use the above list of considerations as a broad structure to our assessment of local thresholds in Section 3 of this advisory note. In particular, we assess the composition of existing town centres in the District, in terms of the existing floorspace in each centre, typical unit sizes, gross floorspace proposed by recent planning

¹ Reference ID 2b-016-20140306

applications for retail development, and the frequency of proposals for different quantities of floorspace. We review these in light of the general health of the town centres and any potential vulnerability identified in health check assessments or other secondary data sources. We further consider the likely impact of proposals on any planned investment, taking into account the existing vitality and viability of centres, town centre strategy or masterplans, in the context of findings on retail capacity in the District.

- 1.7 Before we turn to the specific considerations set out, and our assessment of whether local thresholds are appropriate for Harrogate District (Section 3), in Section 2 of this advisory note we provide a brief summary of the latest retail policy evidence and developments of relevance to the District.

2 RETAIL POLICY AND EVIDENCE BASE

Harrogate Core Strategy

- 2.1 The Harrogate Core Strategy was adopted in February 2009. Policy JB4 provides the strategic policy context for retail and town centre development matters.

Figure 1 – Core Strategy Retail Policy JB4 adopted February 2009

POLICY JB4: RETAIL & TOWN CENTRE DEVELOPMENT

The role of Harrogate town as a Sub Regional Town will be reinforced through:

- expansion of its main shopping area;
- additional food and particularly non-food shopping floorspace;
- construction of a modern transport interchange;
- enhanced office and hotel provision and increased town centre residential development;
- pedestrian and environmental improvements;
- management of on and off street parking.

The vitality and viability of the District Centres in the town of Harrogate will be maintained and enhanced mainly through environmental improvements

The role of Ripon as a Principal Town with the second largest shopping centre in the District will be protected mainly through:

- the expansion of retailing adjacent to the City's shopping area;
- improvements to car parking and the environment.

The role of Knaresborough as a Principal Town with the third largest shopping centre in the District will be protected mainly through:

- improvements to its food retailing and off street parking facilities adjacent to the town's shopping area;
- improvements to the accessibility of the town centre, particularly by public transport and through improvements to the pedestrian environment.

The role of Boroughbridge, Masham and Pateley Bridge as local service centres will be maintained mainly through environmental improvements.

The loss of retailing to other uses will generally be resisted in all the District's shopping centres.

Proposals for retail and town centre development will also be assessed against national planning policy PPS6 and Policy E2 of the Regional Spatial Strategy.

- 2.2 Policy JB4 identifies a total of six centres within the local retail hierarchy, each of which we consider in this advisory note:

- **Sub-Regional Town:** Harrogate;
- **Principal Towns:** Ripon and Knaresborough; and
- **Local Service Centres:** Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge and Masham.

Sites and Policies Development Plan Document

- 2.3 The Council had progressed a Sites and Policies Development Plan Document (DPD) to submission stage, submitting it to the Secretary of State for examination in November 2013. Hearings commenced in April 2014, however the Inspector raised

fundamental concerns regarding the plan (around levels of housing provision and employment land evidence) and invited the Council to consider withdrawing the DPD. In June 2014, Full Council resolved to withdraw the plan and commence work on a new Local Plan.

2.4 As a result, policies put forward within the emerging Sites and Policies DPD do not form part of the statutory development plan. Draft Policy JB7 from the DPD concerned town and local centre management, and was not the subject of any serious concerns raised from the Inspector, or raised in pre-inquiry matters documentation.

2.5 Draft Policy JB7 concerned issues of:

- retaining and increasing control over non-retail uses within centres;
- restriction of non-retail uses in primary and secondary shopping frontages;
- definition of town and local centre boundaries for the context of assessing 'in-centre' locations for the sequential test; and
- setting of local thresholds for impact assessment.

Figure 2 – Relevant parts of draft Policy JB7 (now withdrawn)

POLICY JB7: TOWN AND LOCAL CENTRE MANAGEMENT

Sequential Test

For the purposes of determining proposals for retail development, sites within the defined shopping centres of Harrogate, Ripon, Knaresborough, Boroughbridge, Masham and Pateley Bridge, will be treated as "in centre" locations in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework.

For the purposes of determining proposals for B1 offices, leisure uses, or for other main town centre uses defined by the National Planning Policy Framework, the town centre boundaries of Harrogate, Ripon and Knaresborough; and the shopping centres of Boroughbridge, Masham and Pateley Bridge, will be treated as "in centre" locations in accordance with the National Planning Policy Framework

Impact Test Thresholds

Proposals for retail and leisure developments of the following sizes and in the following locations must be supported by an Impact Assessment as defined by the National Planning Policy Framework:

- 1000 square metres or more located on the edge of Harrogate, Knaresborough and Ripon shopping centres for retail, and town centre boundaries for leisure proposals;
- 500 square metres or more located outside of Harrogate, Knaresborough and Ripon shopping centres for retail, and town centre boundaries for leisure proposals, but within the development limits of the settlement;
- 500 square metres or more located on the edge or outside of Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge and Masham shopping centres but within the development limits of the settlement, or adjacent to one of Harrogate's local centres;
- 250 square metres or more located within a Group B and C village or in the countryside, as defined by Core Strategy Policy SG3.

The Council reserves the right to require an Impact Assessment for development proposals below the above thresholds, or within a centre, where it is considered that they would be likely to have a significant impact on a centre(s).

Harrogate Retail Study (2014)

- 2.6 In October 2014 Harrogate Borough Council published the Harrogate Retail Study, prepared by Peter Brett Associates on its behalf. The new Retail Study updates the previous study published in 2004.
- 2.7 The updated Retail Study provides the following key outputs:
- a comprehensive summary of existing shopping patterns within the District and beyond its boundaries, based on the findings of a new household survey;
 - an assessment of the capacity for convenience and comparison retail floorspace over the plan period to 2026, taking account of commitments and forecast growth in population and expenditure;
 - an assessment of the capacity of existing centres within the District to accommodate any floorspace requirements that are identified, including the identification of appropriate sites;
 - a health-check of the District's existing centres which assesses their relative vitality and viability;
 - the identification of centres in decline and where change needs to be managed, and proposals for such management; and
 - a review of existing town centre boundaries and consideration of the need to identify primary and secondary retail frontages, including their location and approaches to maintaining an appropriate balance of retail and non-retail uses.
- 2.8 Where relevant, the findings set out in the 2014 Retail Study are referenced in this advisory note. Of particular relevance is the assessment of the performance of the main centres in the District and our findings on retail capacity. This is discussed further in Section 3 of this note.

Town and local centre monitoring

- 2.9 The Council has established a bi-annual survey of uses and vacancies in the town and local centres to demonstrate how they are performing. The findings are published in the Council's Annual Monitoring Report (AMR), last published in February 2014. Where relevant, the findings of the latest survey (set out in the AMR) are referenced in this advisory note.

3 LOCAL THRESHOLD CONSIDERATIONS

Scale of proposals relative to town centres

- 3.1 The starting point for our consideration of appropriate local thresholds is to look at the current composition of the study centres. We discuss the floorspace of each centre as a whole in the first instance, followed by the typical unit sizes found in each centre.

Floorspace as a whole

- 3.2 The total gross convenience and comparison retail floorspace of the four main town centres in Harrogate District is set out in Table 1 below. These are taken from the latest Experian GOAD data available to the Council, as published in the Harrogate Retail Study 2014. The GOAD survey areas are based on the extent of ground floor retail or associated commercial activity within a centre and broadly reflect town centre 'shopping areas' previously defined by Policy S2 of the District's Local Plan.
- 3.3 The GOAD data used for each centre are from the following time periods: Harrogate dated June 2013, Ripon dated July 2013, Knaresborough dated September 2012 and Boroughbridge dated November 2011. Although more up to date GOAD surveys may have been undertaken for some of these centres, due to the following reasons the dates listed above are considered sufficient for the purposes of this work:
- the purpose of this assessment is to gain a broad context of the scale of retailing in centres only; and
 - there is no evidence of any fundamental changes to the role or scale of centres in the intervening periods – the Council has provided evidence to this effect through provision of a comprehensive list of planning commitments and completions dating back over 10 years (see Appendix A).
- 3.4 Experian does not provide GOAD survey data for the smaller centres; in Harrogate District these smaller centres include Pateley Bridge and Masham. We therefore have no floorspace data available for these two centres. Equally, HBC does not collect data on the specific floorspace of units as part of the bi-annual survey of centres. The Valuation Office Agency (VOA) is an alternative source for data on sales area retail floorspace, although it is not a comprehensive source of all units in a town centre. For these reasons we do not provide floorspace figures for the smallest two centres.

Table 1 – Retail floorspace in largest centres (total gross)

Centre	Floorspace (sq.m)		Total
	Convenience	Comparison	
Harrogate	13,870	46,280	60,150
Ripon	5,720	13,950	19,670
Knaresborough	1,710	6,390	8,100
Boroughbridge	870	2,860	3,730

Source: Experian GOAD

- 3.5 Table 1 shows that Harrogate provides by far the greatest amount of floorspace in both the comparison and convenience retail sectors, with a total of 60,150 sq. m. Ripon is the second largest centre in the District comprising a total of 19,670 sq. m. Knaresborough is the third largest with 8,100 sq. m followed by Boroughbridge with 3,730 sq. m.
- 3.6 Table 2 below shows the levels of retail floorspace that equate to approximately 10 per cent of the floorspace for both the convenience and comparison retail sectors of each centre. We consider a 10 per cent proportion of the total floorspace to be potentially 'large' in the context of each town centre. This figure is used to provide a general indication of the point at which out-of-centre development could result in potentially significant adverse impacts on the town centre due to the potential turnover of such floorspace and possible patterns of trade diversion. It is based on our experience of auditing retail impact assessments on behalf of numerous local planning authorities. Actual impact will of course depend upon local factors and the specific detail of proposed developments; however we consider this to be an effective trigger point for more detailed consideration of likely impacts through the development management process.

Table 2 – Retail floorspace in largest centres (10% of total gross)

Centre	Floorspace (sq.m)		Total
	Convenience	Comparison	
Harrogate	1,387	4,628	6,015
Ripon	572	1,395	1,967
Knaresborough	171	639	810
Boroughbridge	87	286	373

- 3.7 Based on the floorspace figures presented in Table 2, for Harrogate we would consider a scheme comprising around 1,400 sq. m of gross convenience retail to be 'large'; for Ripon we would consider a scheme of around 600 sq. m gross as 'large'; for Knaresborough a scheme of 200 sq. m gross, and for Boroughbridge around 100 sq. m gross.

- 3.8 Corresponding floorspace figures for comparison retailing are much higher, owing to the higher stock of comparison floorspace already existing in each centre. For Harrogate we would consider a scheme of around 4,600 sq. m gross to be ‘large’; for Ripon a scheme of 1,400 sq. m gross; for Knaresborough a scheme of 600 sq.m gross and Boroughbridge around 300 sq. m gross.

Typical unit sizes

- 3.9 Tables 3 and 4 highlight that the stock of retail property varies considerably in unit size around the District, although all centres tend to be dominated by smaller units. Ripon has the highest proportion of both comparison and convenience retail units over 500 sq. m (8.2 per cent and 11.1 per cent respectively), with Knaresborough and Boroughbridge having the lowest (no comparison or convenience units over 500 sq. m). Unsurprisingly, Harrogate has the largest proportion of very large units of 1,000 sq. m gross or more, reflecting its role as a sub-regional retail centre.
- 3.10 Looking across the four centres at comparison retailing, there are just 15 units in total of 750 sq. m gross or more, all located in Harrogate and Ripon. There are five units between 750 and 1,000 sq. m gross, a further eight between 1,000 and 2,500 sq. m gross, and just two of over 2,500 sq. m gross (both in Harrogate). In terms of convenience retailers there are just four units across all centres larger than 500 sq.m gross, and all of these are in fact greater than 2,500 sq. m gross, being supermarkets or superstores; two are located in Harrogate, and two in Ripon.

Table 3 – Gross comparison retail unit size (number of units)

Floorspace (gross)	Harrogate	Ripon	Knaresborough	Boroughbridge
<100 sq.m	132 (48.2%)	52 (60.5%)	48 (75.0%)	23 (71.9%)
100-250 sq.m	108 (39.4%)	21 (24.4%)	11 (17.2%)	9 (28.1%)
250-500 sq.m	15 (5.5%)	6 (7.0%)	5 (7.8%)	-
500-750 sq.m	6 (2.2%)	5 (5.8%)	-	-
750-1,000 sq.m	4 (1.5%)	1 (1.2%)	-	-
1,000-2,500 sq.m	7 (2.6%)	1 (1.2%)	-	-
>2,500 sq.m	2 (0.7%)	-	-	-
Total	274	86	64	32

Source: Experian GOAD

Table 4 – Gross convenience retail unit size (number of units)

Floorspace (gross)	Harrogate	Ripon	Knaresborough	Boroughbridge
<100 sq.m	20 (71.4%)	10 (55.5%)	10 (62.5%)	4 (57.1%)
100-250 sq.m	5 (17.9%)	6 (33.3%)	5 (31.3%)	2 (28.6%)
250-500 sq.m	1 (3.6%)	-	1 (6.3%)	1 (14.3%)
500-750 sq.m	-	-	-	-
750-1,000 sq.m	-	-	-	-
1,000-2,500 sq.m	-	-	-	-
>2,500 sq.m	2 (7.1%)	2 (11.1%)	-	-
Total	28	18	16	7

Source: Experian GOAD

- 3.11 Based upon the sizes (and distribution of sizes) of existing units in each centre presented in Tables 3 and 4, we have considered the scale of proposals that we believe should be considered ‘large’ in the context of unit sizes. We believe that, as an effective trigger point, that this may justify provision of an accompanying impact assessment with proposals for new development. Table 5 sets out our assessment in relation to unit size, which we use in conjunction with other factors later on in this advisory note, to make our final recommendations.

Table 5 – Assessment of ‘large’ unit size by centre (gross)

Centre	Comparison	Convenience
Harrogate	1,000 sq.m	1,000 sq.m
Ripon	500 sq.m	1,000 sq.m
Knaresborough	250 sq.m	250 sq.m
Boroughbridge	250 sq.m	250 sq.m

Existing viability and vitality of town centres / vulnerability of local town centres

- 3.12 As part of the 2014 Harrogate Retail Study, PBA assessed the health of each of the main town centres in the District. The health checks considered a wide range of indicators. We provide a summary of each centre below, setting out findings with regards to indicators most relevant to the consideration of impact thresholds:
- **Harrogate** Town Centre is considered to be in good overall health. A key identified strength is the quality and diversity of the comparison retail offer in the town centre, with excellent representation of both high-end national retailers, and

independent operators. The convenience retail offer is also considered to be well balanced, with both Asda and Waitrose stores located on the edges of the centre, providing opportunities for linked shopping trips which help to support the other retailers in the centre.

- **Ripon** City Centre is identified as an attractive centre with a good convenience retail offer, however the comparison retail offer is considered to be relatively weak – the recent loss of national multiples from the city centre indicates vulnerability. We concluded that the priority for the city centre should be to strengthen the range and diversity of its comparison retail offer, best achieved by nurturing the centre’s independent retail offer.
- **Knaresborough** Town Centre meets the day-to-day shopping needs of the local population. However despite the convenience retail offer being deemed ‘reasonable’, a qualitative deficiency for a supermarket or superstore is identified. The centre also underperforms in terms of its comparison retail market share, a likely symptom of the District’s largest retail park (St James Retail Park) being located out-of-centre. We concluded that this town centre is underperforming and vulnerable to further erosion of its market share and retail offer as a result of competition from Harrogate Town Centre, out-of-centre stores and other destinations.
- **Boroughbridge** is considered to be a small but vital and vibrant market town centre with a good retail offer that serves local needs well. The centre demonstrates a range of quality independent retail operators and low vacancy rates indicating good overall health.
- **Pateley Bridge** performs well as a small rural service centre, meeting the day-to-day needs of local residents and tourists with good quality shops and services. The centre demonstrates low vacancy rates and a good mix of uses.
- **Masham** is a small market town, currently adequately meeting the needs of locals and visitors for both convenience and comparison shopping. Following the recent relocation of the Co-operative foodstore to a less central location, the town centre is now considered a little elongated and would benefit from some consolidation. It is nevertheless recognised that there are potential difficulties associated with achieving this aim.

3.13 In summary therefore, and as identified in Table 6 below, centres identified to be at particular risk from further edge or out of centre retail development include:

- Ripon (comparison sector in particular);
- Knaresborough (both convenience and comparison retail); and
- Masham due to the recent relocation of the Co-operative foodstore to an out-of-centre location.

3.14 We take these conclusions into account in our final recommendations on appropriate floorspace thresholds.

Table 6 – Potential ‘vulnerability’ to edge/out-of-centre development

Centre	Comparison	Convenience
Harrogate	Low	Low
Ripon	High	Low
Knarborough	High	High
Boroughbridge	Low	Low
Pateley Bridge	Low	Low
Masham	Low	High

Cumulative effects of recent developments

- 3.15 Data on recent retail planning applications is useful when considering whether to set a local floorspace threshold as it provides an indication of the general scale of recent retail proposals. Over the last ten years, there has been a significant number of retail applications for new retail floorspace across Harrogate District.
- 3.16 The Council has provided evidence of a total of 125 applications for new retail floorspace over this period, including both new developments and changes to retail use and extensions to existing retail units. These include schemes granted planning permission (around 80 per cent) and those that were either refused or withdrawn (around 20 per cent).
- 3.17 Table 7 summarises the scale of these applications in the context of their location, both in terms of the retail hierarchy and the sequential test. References in Table 7 to ‘TC’, ‘EOC’ and ‘OOC’ refer to the sequential test, specifically ‘Town Centre’, ‘Edge-of-centre’ and ‘Out-of-centre’ locations respectively. ‘Out of town’ refers to any other location outside the development limits of the six main towns.

Table 7 – Location of planning applications for new retail floorspace (2004-2014)

New floorspace (sales area, sq.m)	Sub-Regional & Principal Towns ²			Local Service Centres ³			Local Centres ⁴		Out of Town	Total
	TC	EOC	OOO	TC	EOC	OOO	TC	EOC		
<100	9	3	20	2	-	2	3	1	21	61
100-250	5	1	6	-	-	1	1	1	6	21
250-500	4	1	2	-	-	2	-	-	1	10
500-750	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1
750-1,000	-	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	2
1,000-2,500	2	2	11	-	-	-	-	-	3	18
>2,500	1	2	5	-	-	-	-	-	4	12
Total	21	11	45	2	-	5	4	2	35	125

Source: HBC monitoring data

- 3.18 In total, there have been 30 planning applications for schemes with over 1,000 sq. m of retail sales area floorspace, at least half of which have been for foodstore schemes. The majority of larger schemes have been located in out-of-centre locations around the sub-regional and principal towns, or in 'out of town' locations.
- 3.19 Table 8 provides a breakdown of the outcomes (for those schemes that are not still pending) by the scale of proposal across the District as a whole. As would be expected, it is clear that the generally larger-scale schemes are more controversial with a much higher proportion of applications for schemes that are over and above 1,000 sq. m (sales area) either ending in refusal of planning permission or withdrawal.

² Harrogate, Knaresborough and Ripon

³ Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge and Masham

⁴ Smaller retailing centres within the Harrogate urban area

Table 8 – Planning application outcomes for new retail floorspace (2004-14)

Floorspace (sales area, sq.m)	Permitted	Refused	Withdrawn	Total
<100 sq.m	52	6	3	61
100-250 sq.m	18	1	1	20
250-500 sq.m	8	-	1	9
500-750 sq.m	1	-	-	1
750-1,000 sq.m	2	-	-	2
1,000-2,500 sq.m	12	3	3	18
>2,500 sq.m	6	4	2	12
Total	99	14	10	123

Source: HBC monitoring data

- 3.20 The pressure for large scale out-of-centre retail proposals demonstrated over the last 10 years in Harrogate District, and the number of large schemes (1,000 sq. m sales area or more) falling below the default threshold of 2,500 sq. m set out in the NPPF, provides further evidence of the need to consider locally specific floorspace thresholds within the District.
- 3.21 Our analysis of planning applications made over the last 10 years (as set out above) leads us to conclude that a local floorspace threshold of 1,000 sq. m sales area would be sufficient to ‘capture’ the major retail proposals around the Sub-Regional and Principal Towns of Harrogate, Knaresborough and Ripon. This level would ensure that potential solus and cumulative impacts on centres could be carefully considered as part of the application’s determination, whilst still only applying the requirement on a small proportion of overall applications.
- 3.22 For the smaller ‘local service centres’ of Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge and Masham, a level of 250 sq.m sales area would provide a similar balance of capturing the major retail proposals in the context of applications over the preceding 10 years, whilst restricting the requirement to a small proportion of overall applications.

Likely effects of further development on any town centre strategy / planned investment

- 3.23 Earlier in this note we have discussed qualitative issues identified in the Harrogate Retail Study, in particular in terms of the vitality and viability of centres. In this final section, we review the quantitative findings from the Retail Study. This allows us to reach some broad conclusions on the likely effects of further development across the District. We also consider any town centre strategies and planned in-centre investment.

- 3.24 Looking firstly at comparison floorspace, the Retail Study identified that, under the 'constant retention rate' scenario, whereby market share of comparison goods expenditure is held constant at present rates, there is a negative requirement for floorspace up to 2016. Thereafter, a modest requirement of 6,184 sq.m of new sales area floorspace will be required to 2026 across the whole District. Assuming that existing commitments in the planning system are implemented, this floorspace requirement will mainly arise between 2021 and 2026. The Retail Study examined possible opportunities for accommodating this need within the six main town centres.
- 3.25 The limited requirements for new floorspace identified in the Retail Study may have further diminished as a result of additional commitments since publication. Accordingly, as a result of this limited expenditure capacity, further edge or out-of-centre retail development has the potential to result in unacceptable adverse impacts on town centres within the District, particularly on the more vulnerable centres.
- 3.26 Although centre specific conclusions cannot be reached based on the information available, the findings from the Retail Study indicate that a generally conservative approach to whether an impact assessment is required for new retail proposals would be appropriate for Harrogate District. We factor this into our 'balanced assessment' of appropriate thresholds set out in our recommendations (Section 4).
- 3.27 Turning to convenience retailing, again under a 'constant retention rate' scenario, the Retail Study identified that there is a negative requirement for new floorspace over the entire period to 2026. This is largely down to the turnover claim from existing commitments which have a particularly significant effect on floorspace requirements. As such, careful monitoring of the implementation of these extant permissions may release significant additional capacity should some of these not be implemented.
- 3.28 As with comparison retailing, on quantitative grounds, a generally conservative approach to whether an impact assessment is required for new retail proposals would therefore be appropriate for the District. As such this is factored into the 'balanced assessment' of appropriate thresholds for convenience retailing set out in our recommendations (Section 4).
- 3.29 In terms of planned in-centre investment, we are aware that planning permission has recently been granted for the redevelopment of the former Beales department store in Harrogate Town Centre. However, this is to be a leisure-led development providing an arts cinema and small retail or restaurant units. We are not aware of any other significant in-centre investment that is planned in any of the District's other centres.
- 3.30 PBA is also currently preparing the Harrogate Town Centre Strategy and Masterplan on behalf of the Borough Council. A draft strategy and masterplan is expected to be published in early 2015 and specific details are not yet available. However, Harrogate Town Centre is currently performing well and setting local impact thresholds in accordance with our assessment of other indicators considered in this advisory note should sufficiently protect the delivery of the future town centre strategy.

4 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 4.1 We have used the guidance available in the NPPG to consider relevant factors in determining the appropriateness of setting local floorspace thresholds in the District in the emerging Local Plan. This note considers a range of factors including:
- the scale of proposals relative to town centres (looking at floorspace as a whole in centres, and typical unit sizes);
 - the existing viability, vitality and vulnerability of town and local centres in terms of qualitative issues;
 - the cumulative effects of recent developments; and
 - the likely effects of further developments on any strategies or investments, in the context of quantitative retail capacity in the District.
- 4.2 Based on our findings it is clear that centres in Harrogate District would benefit from having locally set floorspace thresholds to trigger the need for a formal impact assessment to be submitted alongside planning applications. Due to the size, composition and health of town centres across the District, we do not believe that reliance on the national floorspace threshold (2,500 sq.m) in triggering the need for an impact assessment would be an adequate means of assessing any future edge or out-of-centre proposals. A potentially large number of applications, which could have significance in terms of the nearest town or local centre, could fall below this threshold.
- 4.3 Tables 9 (convenience retailing) and 10 (comparison retailing) summarise the findings of all factors considered in Section 3 of this note. As a result of all the factors considered, we recommend that the Council should consider the following proportionate floorspace thresholds in its emerging Local Plan. All figures relate to gross floorspace proposed, whether from new development, extensions or mezzanine applications, or changes of use:
- Harrogate – 1,000 sq.m convenience retail, 2,500 sq.m comparison retail;
 - Ripon – 1,000 sq.m for both convenience and comparison retail;
 - Knaresborough – 250 sq. m convenience retail and 500 sq. m comparison retail; and
 - Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge, Masham and other rural areas – 250 sq.m for both convenience and comparison retail.
- 4.4 The above recommended thresholds would not necessarily rule out future retailing in edge or out of centre sites. Where centres are healthy and resilient, an impact assessment alongside a sequential assessment could demonstrate that applications are acceptable. The thresholds should simply be seen as a trigger point for the further scrutiny of future retail proposals through the decision making process. Given the continued threats to high streets and town centres this is an important consideration to ensure their future vitality and viability is protected in line with Policy JB4 of the Harrogate Core Strategy.

Table 9 – Convenience goods threshold – balanced assessment

Measure	Source	Harrogate	Ripon	Knares borough	Borough-bridge	Pateley Bridge	Masham
10% of total floorspace (sq.m gross)	Table 2	1,400	600	200	100	-	-
Unit size assessment (sq.m gross)	Table 5	1,000	1,000	250	250	-	-
Particular vulnerability?	Table 6	Low	Low	High	Low	Low	High
Recent developments (sq.m sales area)	Table 7	1,000	1,000	1,000	250	250	250
Likely effects of further development	Paragraphs 3.23-3.30	No current quantitative requirement to 2026, therefore a conservative approach is required to assessing new proposals					
Balanced assessment (sq.m gross)		1,000	1,000	250	250	250	250

Table 10 – Comparison goods threshold – balanced assessment

Measure	Source	Harrogate	Ripon	Knares borough	Borough-bridge	Pateley Bridge	Masham
10% of total floorspace (sq.m gross)	Table 2	4,600	1,400	600	300	-	-
Unit size assessment (sq.m gross)	Table 5	1,000	500	250	250	-	-
Particular vulnerability?	Table 6	Low	High	High	Low	Low	Low
Recent developments (sq.m sales area)	Table 7	1,000	1,000	1,000	250	250	250
Likely effects of further development	Paragraphs 3.23-3.30	Limited requirement for new floorspace 2021 to 2026, therefore a conservative approach is required to assessing new proposals					
Balanced assessment (sq.m gross)		2,500	1,000	500	250	250	250

- 4.5 The recommended thresholds have been derived from a ‘balanced assessment’ of the current state of retailing in centres within the District. We recommend that the Council should also include reference in any policy to the occasional need for such assessments for smaller retail developments where particular concerns arise as a result of the size and nature of any proposals as, over time, local circumstances may

change. In such circumstances however, the Council will need to justify any request carefully and require a 'proportionate' approach to any impact assessment, in line with guidance in the NPPF.

Other main town centre uses

- 4.6 Finally, we consider the recommended thresholds in terms of 'other' types of main town centre uses. The NPPF defines⁵ 'other' types of main town centre uses as: *'leisure, entertainment facilities, the more intensive sport and recreation uses (including cinemas, restaurants, drive-through restaurants, bars and pubs, night-clubs, casinos, health and fitness centres, indoor bowling centres, and bingo halls); offices; and arts, culture and tourism development (including theatres, museums, galleries and concert halls, hotels and conference facilities)'.*
- 4.7 As part of our review of appropriate retail impact thresholds set out in this Note, we have also reviewed the historical patterns of planning applications for 'other' main town centre uses, as provided by the Council. Due to the relatively small number of applications for such uses, and the wide range of uses classified as 'other' main town centre uses, we do not believe it is appropriate to set specific floorspace thresholds.
- 4.8 Instead we recommend that, if the Council makes reference to the occasional need for impact assessments for smaller retail assessments in an emerging policy (set out in paragraph 4.5 above), that this should also refer to 'other' main town centre uses.

⁵ In the Annex 2: Glossary

APPENDIX A PLANNING APPLICATIONS

RETAIL APPLICATIONS 2002-2014

Harrogate, Knaresborough and Ripon

APPLICATION REF	PROPOSAL	ADDRESS	DECISION DATE	DECISION	NET ADDITIONAL FLOORSPACE (SQ.M)	Location
Within Harrogate, Knaresborough or Ripon Shopping Centre Boundary (In Centre)						
05/05325/FUL	Conversion of first floor storage area and second floor flat to create 4 x 1 bed and 1 x 2 bed flats and alterations to ground floor to form 2 retail units and new shop front (site area 0.01ha)	33/35 High Street Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0ET	24-Jan-06	Permitted	158.00	In-centre
06/00182/FUL	Erection of single storey rear extensions.	14 Station Parade Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1UE	22-Feb-06	Permitted	13.00	In-centre
06/00969/FUL	New and altered shop front to provide for 3 retail units, new rear security door and louvre.	Littlewoods 27-31 Cambridge Street Harrogate North Yorkshire	19-Apr-06	Refused	79.00	In-centre
06/01079/FUL	Erection of two storey rear extension with single storey link.	40 High Street Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0EQ	02-May-06	Permitted	262.00	In-centre
06/03028/FUL	Raising roof height to form second storey and alterations to form two retail units.	20 - 22 James Street Harrogate North Yorkshire	03-Aug-06	Permitted	384.00	In-centre
06/04428/FUL	Erection of 1 retail unit.	Land Adjacent To 30 High Street Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0ET	09-Nov-06	Refused	31.00	In-centre
07/02276/FULMAJ	Alterations to approved scheme 6.31.901.R.FULMAJ for the erection of a supermarket and 3 retail units, with first floor commercial and leisure uses to include use classes A1, A2, A3, B1 and D2.	Land to West of Market Place Blossomgate Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2AJ	30-May-07	Permitted	5,205.00	In-centre
07/02617/COU	Change of use of first floor from gallery to form shop (Use Class A1 - Shops).	8 - 12 Montpellier Parade Montpellier Hill Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2TJ	26-Jun-07	Permitted	130.00	In-centre
07/04868/COU	Change of use of first floor flat to form retail and storage space in association with ground floor shop (Use Class A1).	Flat 1 17 Commercial Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1UB	30-Oct-07	Permitted	51.65	In-centre
08/01370/RG3	Change of use from storage (Use class B8 - Storage or Distribution) to Shop (Use Class A1 - Shops) (Revised Scheme).	Former Bathchair Shelter Montpellier Hill Harrogate North Yorkshire	09-May-08	Permitted	12.00	In-centre
08/04039/FUL	Conversion of first floor to form two flats and conversion of ground floor to form 3 retail units with installation of new door (Site Area 0.02ha).	1, 3 And 5 Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1BB	27-Oct-08	Permitted	198.50	In-centre
08/05126/FULMAJ	Erection of 3 storey rear extension and conversion to form 3 retail units (Use Class A1-Shops), 2 restaurants (Use Class A3 - Restaurants and Cafes), office accommodation (Use Class B1- Business) and 14 apartments (Site Area 0.09ha) (Revised Scheme).	17-23 Parliament Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2QU	07-Jan-09	Permitted	426.00	In-centre
08/05599/FUL	Erection of single storey extension to south elevation to form new shop front and conversion of shop and stores to form 3 shops.	5 Queen Street Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1EG	19-Jan-09	Permitted	25.00	In-centre
10/00840/FUL	Refurbishment of public house and conversion of first floor and roof space to form 3 flats, erection of detached building comprising 2 retail units, 4 flats and carport and formation of vehicle access and hard standing (site area 0.06ha).	The Station Hotel 19 Finkle Street Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 8AA	25-May-10	Permitted	75.90	In-centre
10/05457/FUL	Erection of single storey extension.	Westgate Frames 12 Westgate Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2AT	16-Feb-11	Permitted	12.00	In-centre
12/04462/FULMAJ	UK Superbowl 24 Tower Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1HS	Erection of 70 bed hotel with either use class D2 or A1, A2, A3 use to basement and ground floor (Revised Scheme).	30-Jan-13	PER	1,600.00	In-centre
13/04137/FUL	Delmas 23 Westgate Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2BQ	Change of use to allow mixed use retail (use class A1) and cafe (use class A3)	12-Dec-13	PER	145.00	In-centre
13/04726/FUL	22 - 23 North Street Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1HJ	Change of use from a nightclub (Use Class - Sui Generis) to a hair and beauty salon (Use Class - A1 Shops) and external alterations.	21-Feb-14	PER	304.00	In-centre
14/00107/FUL	80 & 82 High Street Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0EA	Change of use of part ground floor to mixed use facilities to include A1 (Shops), A2 (Financial and Professional Services), A3 Restaurants and Cafes), A5 (Hot Food Takeaway) and B1 (Business) and conversion of first and second floors to form 4 dwellings with ground floor access. (Site Area 0.02ha)	24-Jun-14	PER	54.00	In-centre
14/00811/FULMAJ	17-23 Parliament Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2QU	Erection of 3 storey extension and conversion of shop (Use Class A1) and restaurant (Use Class A3) to form 2 shops (Use Class A1), 1 restaurant (Use Class A3), 1 flexible unit (Use Class A3 and A4) and 1 flexible unit (Use Class A1 and A3).	23-Jun-14	PER	205.00	In-centre
14/01697/FULMAJ	Beales Department Stores 5 Albert Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1JU	Partial demolition of existing store and erection of cinema with associated units to include retail and restaurants (Class A1, A2, A3 and A4 uses) (Amended Plans Received).	01-Oct-14	PER	1,033.00	In-centre
					Average:	495.43
Within 300m of Harrogate, Knaresborough or Ripon Shopping Centre Boundary (Edge-of-Centre)						
07/00012/FULMAJ	Formation of first floor.	Asda Stores Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5DE	14-May-07	Refused	3,716.00	Edge-of-centre
07/00433/FUL	Conversion of ground floor to form Retail and Restaurants (Use Class A1, A2 and A3), erection of shop fronts and installation of replacement windows to all elevations.	Clarendon House 9 Victoria Avenue Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1EQ	12-Mar-07	Permitted	535.00	Edge-of-centre
07/06194/FULMAJ	Formation of first floor (Revised Scheme).	Asda Stores Limited Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5DE	26-Feb-08	Withdrawn	3,716.00	Edge-of-centre
09/00116/FUL	Change of use from office (Use Class B1- Business) to retail (Use Class A1 - Shops) and formation of shop front.	24 Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1BW	09-Mar-09	Permitted	28.80	Edge-of-centre
09/05315/FUL	Formation of mezzanine floor.	Asda Stores Limited Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5DE	15-Mar-10	Permitted	947.00	Edge-of-centre
10/04571/FUL	Change of use from car showroom and repairs to retail (Use Class A1 - Shops) and installation of 2 glazed screens and doors.	30 North Street Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1HJ	24-Jan-11	Permitted	434.00	Edge-of-centre
11/03938/COU	Change of use of basement and ground floors of 26 Kings Road from office (Use Class - B1) to Doctors Surgery with ancillary office space (Use Class - D1) and partial change of use of 28 Kings Road from Doctors Surgery (Use Class - D1) to Pharmacy (Use Class - A1).	26 And 28 Kings Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5JW	05-Dec-11	Permitted	44.00	Edge-of-centre
11/00274/COU	Change of use from offices to hairdressing (Use Class A1 - Shops).	24 Mount Parade Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1BX	21-Mar-11	Permitted	104.00	Edge-of-centre
12/00077/FUL	Erection of single storey extension and formation of additional parking spaces (Revised Scheme).	BP Petrol Station North Street Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1DP	27-Feb-12	Permitted	100.00	Edge-of-centre
12/02002/FULMAJ	Erection of mezzanine floor, ground floor and first floor extensions and external fire escape.	Asda Stores Limited Bower Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5DE	24-Aug-12	Permitted	1,042.00	Edge-of-centre
14/00969/FULMAJ	Land South Of 36 Stonebridgegate Ripon North Yorkshire	Erection of supermarket and formation of hardstanding to form car park and access. (Amended Plans received with revised access position).	10-Sep-14	PER	1,536.00	Edge-of-centre
					Average:	1,109.35

APPLICATION REF	PROPOSAL	ADDRESS	DECISION DATE	DECISION	NET ADDITIONAL FLOORSPACE (SQ.M)	Location
Beyond 300m of Harrogate, Knaresborough or Ripon Shopping Centre Boundary but within the Development Limit (Out-of-Centre)						
02/03119/FUL	Erection of 2,155sq.m.(approx) extension to existing supermarket (Use Class A1) with altered vehicular access from Railway Road. (AMENDED SCHEME)	J Sainsbury Wetherby Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8QZ	01-Nov-04	Permitted	2,155.00	Out-of-centre
05/02653/FULMAJ	Erection of new DIY retail warehouse and garden centre. Partial demolition of existing DIY store and use of remaining floor space for non-food retail with new access road, parking and servicing areas and landscape works (site area 1.732 ha).	Land At Grid Ref 429305/457027 Oak Beck Road Harrogate North Yorkshire	14-Dec-05	Permitted	3,067.00	Out-of-centre
06/00124/FUL	Erection of two storey front extension to form additional business unit.(Revised Scheme)	2E Knaresborough Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 7SP	13-Feb-06	Permitted	25.00	Out-of-centre
06/00172/FUL	Erection of showroom under existing external canopy.	286 Skipton Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 3HE	16-Feb-06	Withdrawn	91.00	Out-of-centre
06/00650/FULMAJ	Erection of new DIY retail warehouse, garden centre and non-food retail. Partial demolition of existing DIY store and use of remaining floor space for non-food retail with new access road, parking and servicing areas and landscape works. (Site Area 1.732 ha, Revised Scheme)	Land At Grid Ref 429305/457027 Oak Beck Road Harrogate North Yorkshire	10-Apr-06	Permitted	3,067.00	Out-of-centre
06/01085/FUL	Erection of single storey front extension.	2A Russell Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8DJ	02-May-06	Permitted	13.40	Out-of-centre
06/01925/OUTMAJ	Outline application for the erection of extension to supermarket including associated car parking with siting and access considered (Site Area 1.35 ha) (Revised Scheme)	Yorkshire Co-Operative Ltd Chain Lane Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0DH	14-Aug-06	Permitted	1,920.00	Out-of-centre
06/02241/FULMAJ	Erection of food store with associated car parking and formation of new vehicular access.	Strikes Garden Centre York Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0SP	06-Sep-06	Withdrawn	1,063.00	Out-of-centre
06/02421/COUMAJ	Change of Use of Car Showroom and ancillary workshops (Sui Generis) to form Retail unit (Use Class A1 - Shops)	Massingberd VW Ripon Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2BX	03-Jul-06	Refused	1,176.00	Out-of-centre
06/03834/FUL	Erection of single storey extension, car wash, jet wash screen, associated equipment and alterations to access.	Petrol Filling Station At J Sainsbury Wetherby Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8QZ	15-Sep-06	Permitted	21.00	Out-of-centre
06/04309/FUL	Erection of single storey rear extension.	46 Church Avenue Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HG	13-Nov-06	Permitted	13.60	Out-of-centre
06/04544/FUL	Change of use of part of canteen to form retail outlet (Use Class A1- Shops) (Revised Scheme).	Masham Auction Mart Masham Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 4ER	06-Nov-06	Refused	21.00	Out-of-centre
06/04856/FUL	Erection of single storey side and front extension.	18A Boroughbridge Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0NJ	13-Nov-06	Permitted	11.30	Out-of-centre
06/06099/FUL	Erection of single storey rear extension.	One Stop 40B Crab Lane Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 3BG	22-Jan-07	Permitted	165.00	Out-of-centre
06/06311/FUL	Erection of extension to car showroom.	Piccadilly Motors Dallamires Lane Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1TT	05-Feb-07	Permitted	54.00	Out-of-centre
07/04760/FULMAJ	Erection of food store with associated landscaping and formation of new vehicular access (revised scheme).	York Road Nurseries York Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0SP	04-Jul-08	Permitted	868.00	Out-of-centre
07/01454/FULMAJ	Erection of foodstore with new access road, car parking, 1.8 metre high boundary fencing and associated landscaping (Revised Scheme).	Land To The North East Of Focus Oak Beck Road Harrogate North Yorkshire	07-Nov-08	Permitted	1,261.00	Out-of-centre
07/04411/FULMAJ	Erection of Class A1 retail store, ancillary facilities and services, car park, revised access and widening to Skipton Road, access to Ripon Road, pedestrian and vehicular bridges across Oak Beck, pedestrian link to Electric Avenue, automatic recycling facility and landscaping.	Site Of North East Gas Offices And Service Centre Skipton Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 3EX	14-Nov-07	Withdrawn	10,006.00	Out-of-centre
07/05472/FULMAJ	Erection of detached warehouse, office and shop and alternations to vehicular access (Revised Scheme).	Land At Grid Reference 436271 456198 Wetherby Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire	04-Feb-09	Permitted	70.00	Out-of-centre
08/00037/FULMAJ	Erection of single storey side, front and rear extensions.	Wm Morrisons Harrogate Road Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2SB	17-Mar-08	Withdrawn	1,274.00	Out-of-centre
08/02998/FUL	Erection of single storey rear extension (revised scheme).	48 King Edwards Drive Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HL	08-Sep-08	Permitted	57.91	Out-of-centre
08/03571/FULMAJ	Erection of single storey side, front and rear extensions (Revised Scheme).	Wm Morrisons Harrogate Road Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2SB	27-Nov-08	Permitted	1,210.00	Out-of-centre
08/03748/FUL	Erection of single storey front extension.	Ripon Farm Services Limited Dallamires Lane Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1TT	07-Oct-08	Refused	193.00	Out-of-centre
08/05341/COU	Change of use of warehouse (use class B8 - Storage and Distribution) to form agricultural supplies and pet food shop (use class A1 - Shops).	Unit 4 Poplars Industrial Estate Boroughbridge York North Yorkshire YO51 9HS	30-Dec-08	Permitted	158.00	Out-of-centre
08/05393/FUL	Erection of single storey front extension (Revised Scheme).	Ripon Farm Services Limited Dallamires Lane Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1TT	31-Dec-08	Permitted	66.00	Out-of-centre
08/05818/FUL	Change of use of part of first floor flat to form staff accommodation, store and coffee lounge for customers (Use Class A1 - Shops).	34 Hookstone Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8BW	02-Feb-09	Permitted	70.00	Out-of-centre
08/05810/FUL	Erection of single storey side extension and fire escape to serve first floor flat.	Bondgate Post Office 64 Bondgate Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 1QE	03-Feb-09	Permitted	33.30	Out-of-centre
08/05891/FUL	Retention of temporary detached timber storage building.	Martin McColls Newsagent 62 - 64 King Edwards Drive Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HL	06-Apr-09	Refused	12.50	Out-of-centre
09/01083/FULMAJ	Composite application for deep discounted food store and erection of single storey front and side extensions with alterations to car parking area and access.	Unit 1 Adjoining Focus DIY Harrogate Retail Park Oak Beck Road Harrogate North Yorkshire	01-Mar-10	Closed	357.00	Out-of-centre
09/02704/FULMAJ	Erection of Class A1 superstore, car park, revised access and widening to Skipton Road, access to Ripon Road, pedestrian and vehicular bridges across Oak Beck, pedestrian link to Electric Avenue, recycling facility, landscaping and all ancillary facilities to include felling of various trees within Tree Preservation Order 24/2001(revised scheme).	Site Of North East Gas Offices And Service Centre Skipton Road Harrogate North Yorkshire	29-Feb-12	Permitted	4,038.00	Out-of-centre
10/00632/FUL	Erection of single storey side extension, single storey lean-to and conversion of outbuilding to form games room	Harlow Inn 141 Otley Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 0AG	16-Apr-10	Permitted	82.60	Out-of-centre
10/02265/FUL	Erection of rear extension.	126 King Edwards Drive Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HW	06-Jul-10	Permitted	26.00	Out-of-centre
10/03567/FUL	Erection of single storey side extension (Revised Scheme).	Avenue Bakery Limited 46 Church Avenue Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HG	08-Nov-10	Permitted	39.40	Out-of-centre
11/00338/FUL	Erection of single storey extension and change of use of part of doctors surgery (Use Class D1 - non residential institutions) to form pharmacy (Use Class A1 - Shops).	49 - 51 Leeds Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8AY	08-Jun-11	Refused	74.55	Out-of-centre
11/01609/COU	Change of use of office (Use Class A2 - Finance and professional services) to hot and cold food sandwich shop	50 King Edwards Drive Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4HL	21-Jun-11	Permitted	49.00	Out-of-centre
11/01958/FULMAJ	Erection of furniture showroom with associated car parking and landscaping.	Former Harrogate Audi St James Business Park Grimbald Crag Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 8PY	26-Aug-11	Permitted	1,775.00	Out-of-centre
11/01562/REPMAJ	Replacement of outline planning permission 06/01925/OUTMAJ and reserved matters 09/03399/REMAJ for the erection of extension to supermarket including associated car parking (Site Area 1.35 ha)	Co Operative Retail Chain Lane Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 0DH	26-Oct-11	Permitted	1,812.00	Out-of-centre
11/04727/REPMAJ	Replacement planning permission for 6.500.106.AB.FULMAJ (expiry date 27.11.2011) - Erection of single storey side, front and rear extensions (Revised Scheme).	Wm Morrisons Harrogate Road Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 2SB	30-Jan-12	Withdrawn	1,274.00	Out-of-centre
12/00504/FUL	Partial change of use of ground floor to retail use (Use Class A1 - Shops) with installation of door and replacement window and office to first floor.	Prophecy Lodge Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 8DA	04-Apr-12	Permitted	61.00	Out-of-centre
12/00816/FULMAJ	Demolition of existing car showroom and erection of retail store with cafe and offices, alteration of vehicular access, formation of off site parking and off-site highway works (amended details).	Nidd Vale Motors 91 - 97 Leeds Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8BE	04-Jul-12	Permitted	3,017.00	Out-of-centre
14/00208/FUL	Dreams Unit 1 Harrogate Retail Park Oak Beck Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 3HT	Erection of extension to side and front (site area 436 sq metres)	11-Jun-14	PER	436.00	Out-of-centre
14/02919/FUL	GC Motors Ripon Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2BX	Erection of car showroom over valeting bay.	22-Sep-14	REF	220.00	Out-of-centre
14/04028/FUL	GC Motors Ripon Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 2BX	Erection of car showroom over permitted valeting bay (revised scheme).			221.00	Out-of-centre
14/03096/FUL	The White Swan Inn Wighill Tadcaster North Yorkshire LS24 8BQ	Conversion of storage building to form village shop and 8 lettable rooms (Site area 0.02ha).	13-Oct-14	PER	192.00	Out-of-centre
14/03118/FULMAJ	Unit 55t James Retail Park Grimbald Crag Road Knaresborough North Yorkshire HG5 8PZ	Installation of first floor.	14-Oct-14	PER	1,807.00	Out-of-centre
					Average:	969.43

Harrogate Town Local Centres

APPLICATION REF	PROPOSAL	ADDRESS	DECISION DATE	DECISION	NET ADDITIONAL FLOORSPACE (SQ.M)	Location
Within a Local Centre in Harrogate						
06/05827/RENEW	Renewal of unimplemented permission 6.79.5937.B.FUL for the conversion of shop to form 2 units including the erection of new shopfronts, erection of rear extension to shops and first floor extension to flat over unit 7.	7-9 Westmoreland Street Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 5AY	11-Dec-06	Withdrawn	18.50	In-centre (local centre)
08/01710/FUL	Division of shop to form 2 units, installation of replacement shop front and new rear fire escape	59 - 61 Leeds Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8AA	10-Jun-08	Permitted	177.00	In-centre (local centre)
10/02817/FUL	Erection of 2 storey extension to replace single storey buildings, conversion of shop to form 2 shops and creation of 6 flats (Site Area 0.67ha).	6 - 7 Devonshire Place Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 4AA	28-Mar-11	Permitted	63.00	In-centre (local centre)
14/00765/FUL	39 High StreetHarrogateNorth YorkshireHG2 7LQ	Erection of single storey extension.	07-May-14	PER	9.80	In-centre (local centre)
					Average:	67.08
Adjacent to a Local Centre in Harrogate						
07/05737/COU	Change of use of ground floor car showroom to retail unit (Use Class A1 - Shops).	151 - 155 Kings Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG1 1JQ	04-Jan-08	Permitted	236.50	Edge-of-centre (local centre)
11/02706/FUL	Erection of single storey extension, internal alterations and installation of 1 window, 1 door and 1 ATM to facilitate use as a local convenience store (Revised Scheme).	The Mile Post 55 Leeds Road Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 8AY	27-Jan-12	Permitted	23.00	Edge-of-centre (local centre)
					Average:	129.75

Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge and Masham

APPLICATION REF	PROPOSAL	ADDRESS	DECISION DATE	DECISION	NET ADDITIONAL FLOORSPACE (SQ.M)	Location
Inside the Shopping Centre Boundary of Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge or Masham						
07/04701/FUL	Change of use of ground floor from dwelling to form Jewellers workshop and showroom (Use Class A1 - Shops).	The Cottage Bridge Street Boroughbridge York North Yorkshire YO51 9LA	24-Oct-07	Permitted	21.00	In-centre (local service centres)
08/00163/FUL	Change of use of ground floor from dwelling to form Jewellers workshop and showroom (Use Class A1 - Shops) (Revised Scheme).	The Cottage Bridge Street Boroughbridge York North Yorkshire YO51 9LA	20-Feb-08	Permitted	20.30	In-centre (local service centres)
					Average:	20.65
Outside of Boroughbridge, Pateley Bridge or Masham Shopping Centre Boundary but within the Development Limit						
06/02499/FUL	Change of use of part of canteen to form retail outlet (Use Class A1- Shops).	Masham Auction Mart Masham Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 4ER	03-Jul-06	Refused	18.16	Out-of-centre (local service centres)
09/01235/COU	Change of Use from offices (Use Class B1 - Business) to pet shop (Use Class A1 - Shops).	Nor Feed Uk Ltd Station Terrace Boroughbridge York North Yorkshire YO51 9BU	18-May-09	Permitted	26.86	Out-of-centre (local service centres)
10/01785/FUL	Erection of supermarket with associated car parking.	W E Jameson And Son Limited1 - 7 Leyburn Road Masham Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 4ER	17-Jun-10	Withdrawn	383.00	Out-of-centre (local service centres)
10/04258/FUL	Erection of supermarket with associated car parking (Revised Scheme).	W E Jameson And Son Limited 1 - 7 Leyburn Road Masham Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 4ER	12-Jan-11	Permitted	383.00	Out-of-centre (local service centres)
13/03420/FUL	Filling StationPateley BridgeHarrogateNorth YorkshireHG3 5HQ	Erection of extension, and alterations to, amenity building to form larger convenience store; formation of bin store and vehicular parking; and refurbishment of filling station forecourt including replacement pumps, underground tanks and vents.	11-Jun-14	PER	185.00	Out-of-centre (local service centres)
					Average:	199.20

Rest of the District

APPLICATION REF	PROPOSAL	ADDRESS	DECISION DATE	DECISION	NET ADDITIONAL FLOORSPACE (SQ.M)	Location
Any other location outside the development limits of the 6 main towns						
06/03040/FUL	Erection of farm shop and relocation of detached agricultural building.	Home Farm Risplith Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 3EP	30-Aug-06	Permitted	60.80	Out-of-town
07/00415/FUL	Erection of detached building to be used as a farm shop.	Land To The Rear Hawthorne House FarmDunkeswick Leeds North Yorkshire LS17 9LP	27-Feb-07	Permitted	60.00	Out-of-town
07/01081/FUL	Amendment to approved scheme 6.51.54.B.FUL for the erection of a farm shop and relocation of existing agricultural barn, to include the provision of a disabled WC and lobby.	Home Farm Risplith Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 3EP	13-Apr-07	Permitted	65.80	Out-of-town
07/01386/FUL	Erection of single storey side extension to form shop and change of use of part of building from shop to shop and restaurant (Use Class A3 - Restaurants and Use Class A1 - Shops) and offices ancillary to smoke house to kitchen and toilets (revised scheme).	Wood Nook Farm Hardisty Hill Blubberhouses Otley North Yorkshire LS21 2PQ	04-May-07	Permitted	37.08	Out-of-town
07/01793/FUL	Erection of two storey link extension to form extension to shop (Use Class A1 - Shops) on ground floor and additional living accommodation on first floor.	1 Castle Street Spofforth Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1AP	21-May-07	Permitted	62.50	Out-of-town
07/03095/FULMAJ	Erection of amenity building in association with proposed motorway service area.	Moto Wetherby Motorway Service Area Deighton RoadKirk Deighton Wetherby North Yorkshire LS22 5GT	28-Sep-07	Permitted	2,605.00	Out-of-town
07/03491/FUL	Erection of single storey side extensions and single storey rear extension.	Geoffrey Benson And Son Furniture Showrooms York Road Kirk Hammerton North Yorkshire YO26 8DH	24-Aug-07	Permitted	171.00	Out-of-town
07/05582/FUL	Erection of double garage to side (Revised Scheme).	Townsend Undertakers Oakfield House Tofts Lane Follifoot Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1DY	21-Dec-07	Permitted	30.00	Out-of-town
07/06422/FUL	Erection of single storey side extension and 2.4m high fence and gate.	Mercedes Benz Of Harrogate Leeds Road Pannal Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1EP	07-Mar-08	Permitted	89.00	Out-of-town
08/00224/COUMAJ	Retention of use as Garden Centre	Brookside Nursery Leeds RoadPannal Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 1EW	14-Apr-08	Refused	1,648.00	Out-of-town
08/00655/FUL	Erection of single storey front extension to form office, single storey rear and side extension to form cafe, and extension to car park	Newby Hall Farm Shop Leeming LaneMilby York North Yorkshire YO51 9DE	11-Apr-08	Withdrawn	139.25	Out-of-town
08/01589/FUL	Conversion of outbuilding to form village shop (Use Class A1 - Shops) to include indoor seating area and external alterations.	Shoulder Of Mutton Inn Follifoot Lane Kirkby Overblow Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1HD	19-May-08	Permitted	25.00	Out-of-town
08/01841/COU	Change of use of office (Use Class B1-Business) to dry cleaning shop (Use Class A1-Shops).	Eagle Three Court The Carr Pannal Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1ER	23-Jun-08	Permitted	100.00	Out-of-town
08/03451/COUMAJ	Retention of use as Garden Centre (revised scheme).	Brookside Nursery Leeds Road Pannal Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 1EW	01-Sep-08	Refused	1,648.00	Out-of-town
08/03835/FUL	Erection of single storey side and rear extension to farm shop to provide cafe, single storey front extension to form office, and extension to car park.	Newby Hall Farm Shop Leeming Lane Milby York North Yorkshire YO51 9DE	13-Oct-08	Permitted	45.79	Out-of-town
08/05267/FUL	Erection of single storey extension to shop to form sales area and workshop.	Hammerton Cars York Road Kirk Hammerton York North Yorkshire YO26 8EQ	30-Dec-08	Permitted	36.60	Out-of-town
08/05860/EIAMAJ	Outline application for the erection of motorway service area comprising amenity building, petrol filling station, heavy goods vehicle amenity building, car parking and associated landscaping with access considered (site area 19.3ha).	Land Comprising OS Field 3300, 3369, 5500, 7800 And 9435 Kirby Hill North Yorkshire	30-Mar-09	Refused	4,780.00	Out-of-town
09/01642/FUL	Change of use of ground floor of dwelling to form cafe (Use Class A3 - Restaurants and Cafes) and erection of single storey rear extension.	Cock Pit Farm Weston Otley North Yorkshire LS21 2SD	03-Aug-09	Permitted	38.06	Out-of-town
09/01663/FUL	Erection of two storey rear extension, detached garage and store for dwelling and felling of 1 Eucalyptus and 1 Lilac within Follifoot Conservation Area.	Follifoot Post Office Main Street Follifoot Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 1DU	24-Jun-09	Permitted	27.00	Out-of-town
09/03431/FUL	Change of use from car dealership to retail of care equipment (Use class A1 - retail) with installation of window to west elevation and widening of front entrance.	Linkside Garage Forest Lane Head Harrogate North Yorkshire HG2 7TE	19-Oct-09	Permitted	1,683.00	Out-of-town
09/03502/COU	Change of use of warehouse (Use Class B8 - Storage or Distribution) to warehouse (Use Class B8 - Storage or Distribution) with ancillary bicycle showroom area.	Stif Activities Limited The Damsen Unit 4 New York Mills Thomas Gill Road Summerbridge Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 4LA	29-Sep-09	Permitted	165.00	Out-of-town
09/03671/FUL	Retention of use of barn as shop and part of field as archery range with fencing and targets.	Slensingford Watermill INorth Stanley Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 3HQ	22-Dec-09	Permitted	56.00	Out-of-town
09/04599/FUL	Conversion of storage building to form village shop	The George Inn Main Street Wath Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 5EN	21-Dec-09	Withdrawn	21.70	Out-of-town
10/01258/FUL	Conversion of storage building to form village shop (Revised Scheme).	The George Inn Main Street Wath Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 5EN	17-May-10	Permitted	21.70	Out-of-town
10/01400/FUL	Conversion of outbuilding to form shop with single storey side extension.	Royal Oak InnMain StreetStaveleyKnaresboroughNorth Yorkshire HG5 9LD	08-Jun-10	Permitted	28.00	Out-of-town
10/01982/EIAMAJ	Outline application for the erection of motorway service area comprising an amenity building, hotel, filling station, sewage treatment plant, balancing pond, and new access from the A61 with associated parking and landscaping (site area 18.8ha).	Field South Of Junction Leeming Lane And Hutton GrangeHutton ConyersNorth Yorkshire	16-Oct-12	Refused	2,507.00	Out-of-town
10/02490/EIAMAJ	Outline application for the erection of motorway service area comprising amenity building, lodge, petrol filling station, parking to include heavy goods parking with associated showers and toilet facilities, police post and associated infrastructure with access considered (site area 13.36ha).	Land Comprising Field At 435074 475842Hutton ConyersNorth Yorkshire	16-Oct-12	Refused	4,350.00	Out-of-town
10/03232/FUL	Conversion of stables and store to form village shop.	The Lamb Inn Rainton Thirsk North Yorkshire YO7 3PH	03-Sep-10	Permitted	32.00	Out-of-town
11/01337/FUL	Retention of village shop (converted from stables and store) with uPVC windows and opening hours of 0800-1800 Monday to Friday, 0900-1300 Saturdays Sundays and Bank Holidays.	The Lamb Inn Rainton Thirsk North Yorkshire YO7 3PH	23-Jun-11	Permitted	32.00	Out-of-town
11/02441/FUL	Partial change of use of disused poultry house to form farm shop, 2 single storey extensions to poultry house and formation of new vehicular access.	Urkett House Minskip York North Yorkshire YO51 9HY	03-Aug-11	Permitted	110.00	Out-of-town
11/03559/FUL	Erection of single storey extension (revised scheme).	Millstones Restaurant Skipton Road Felliscliffe Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 2LT	24-Oct-11	Permitted	27.00	Out-of-town
11/03519/DVCON	Variation of condition 2 of planning permission 6.66.136.G.COU to allow retail use in the warehouse and storage use in the retail area.	Stif Activities Limited The Damsen Unit 4 New York Mills Thomas Gill Road Summerbridge Harrogate North Yorkshire HG3 4LA	31-Oct-11	Permitted	330.00	Out-of-town
11/03295/COU	Change of use of storage building (Use Class B8 - Storage) to retail unit (Use class A1 - Shops)	Swinton Park Hotel Swinton Ripon North Yorkshire HG4 4JH	16-Nov-11	Permitted	100.00	Out-of-town
12/00531/FUL	Erection of farm shop.	Tancred Field Farm Whixley York North Yorkshire YO26 8BA	02-Apr-12	Permitted	143.00	Out-of-town
12/00715/FUL	Erection of extension to motorway service area building.	Moto Wetherby Motorway Service Area Deighton RoadKirk Deighton Wetherby North Yorkshire LS22 5GT	16-May-12	Permitted	245.60	Out-of-town
Average:					614.88	